BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 03327 1933

ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT LAW

VOLUME I

ARTICLES, CASES, GUIDELINES, COMMENTARIES

INSTRUCTOR:

JACK D. COOP

THESE MATERIALS WERE FIRST PREPARED BY RODNEY NORTHEY FOR TEACHING PURPOSES AT OSGOODE HALL LAW SCHOOL IN 1994. WITH MR. NORTHEY'S PERMISSION, I HAVE SUBSTANTIALLY MODIFIED AND UPDATED THEM FOR TEACHING PURPOSES AT THE UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO LAW SCHOOL DURING THE WINTER 1995 TERM. THESE UPDATED MATERIALS ARE NOT INTENDED FOR PUBLICATION OR DISTRIBUTION.

C copyright, 1995, Jack D. Coop and Rodney Northey

KF
3775
C66
1995
v. 1
c. 1

ANQ-4670
BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
SEP 12 1995
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT LAW

VOLUME I

ARTICLES, CASES, GUIDELINES, COMMENTARIES

INSTRUCTOR:

JACK D. COOP

THESE MATERIALS WERE FIRST PREPARED BY RODNEY NORTHEY FOR TEACHING PURPOSES AT OSGOODE HALL LAW SCHOOL IN 1994. WITH MR. NORTHEY'S PERMISSION, I HAVE SUBSTANTIALLY MODIFIED AND UPDATED THEM FOR TEACHING PURPOSES AT THE UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO LAW SCHOOL DURING THE WINTER 1995 TERM. THESE UPDATED MATERIALS ARE NOT INTENDED FOR PUBLICATION OR DISTRIBUTION.

C copyright, 1995, Jack D. Coop and Rodney Northey

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/environmentalass01coop

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PART 1. INTRODUCTION TO COURSE

1. What is Environmental Assessment? 1
2. "Why Do We Need Environmental Assessment?" from Estrin, D., Swaigen, J. (eds.) Environment on Trial (2d) (CELRF, 1978) 4
3. "Environmental Impact Assessment and Monitoring" by T.Meredith, from Mitchell, B. (ed.), Resource Management and Development (Oxford Press, 1991) (excerpts) 5
4. "The Canadian Environmental Assessment Act: Tremulous Step Forward, or Retreat into Smoke and Mirrors?" by T.Schrecker from (1991), 5 C.E.L.R.(N.S.) 192 10

PART 2. ONTARIO ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT ACT

2A. Background to Ontario Environmental Assessment

1. Background to the Ontario EA Process 19
2. Background to the Ontario EA Process (JC) 21
3. Environmental Assessment - Statistical Summary - 1992 22
4. Environmental Assessment Charts - February 29, 1995 32

2B. Application of Ontario EAA

The Application of the Ontario EA Process 38

Defining the undertaking

1. Re Joint Board and Regional Municipality of Ottawa-Carleton (excerpt) (1985), 17 O.M.B.R. (Div.Ct.) 42
2. Re Joint Board and Reg. Mun. of Ottawa-Carleton (excerpt) (1985), 17 O.M.B.R. (Ont. C.A.) 46

Application to plans

1. "Waste Management Master Plans", from MOE Introduction to Waste Management Planning and the Ontario Environmental Assessment Act (excerpts) (July 1990) 49
2. *In the Matter of Ontario Hydro and the Environmental Assessment Act* (Interim Ruling) (November 4, 1992) (EAB) 52
3. *In the Matter of the Five Year Review of the Niagara Escarpment Plan* (Interim Ruling) (August 31, 1991) (EAB) 56

Private sector application

1. Table 1: Criteria government the application of the EAA 65
2. Recent Private Sector EA Designations 66
3. Re Lawgren Group Inc. (Interim Decision) (December 17, 1991) (Joint Board) 67
4. O.Reg. 345/93 77

EA exemptions

1. Re the Town of Milton and Ontario Waste Management Corp. (excerpt) (1985), 50 O.R. (2d) (Div.Ct.) 78
2. Project Screening and Application for exemption under section 29 of the Environmental Assessment Act (excerpts) (MOE, 1983) 80
3. EAAC Committee Information Sheet 86
4. Ontario Environmental Assessment Advisory Committee - 11th Annual Report (1993 - 1994) 88
5. Bump-Ups, Designations, Exemptions and Referral Charts (EA Branch, February 28, 1995) 103
6. O. Reg. 658/90 108

2C. Timing of Environmental Assessment

The Timing of an Environmental Assessment 109

2D. Administration of Environmental Assessment

1. The Administration of an Environmental Assessment 110
2. The Administration of an EA (JC) 114

2E. EA Planning Process

1. The Environmental Assessment Planning Process 115
2. The EA Planning Process and Private Sector EAs 119
3. The EA Planning Process and Private Sector EAs (JC) 120
4. MOEE Guideline E-3 (formerly 03-04), "EA Planning and Approvals" (April 1994), ... 121
5. MOEE Procedure E-3-1 (formerly referenced by 03-04), "Interim Procedures for Environmental Assessment Planning and Approvals" (July 1989) 127
6. MOE Interim Guidelines on EA Planning and Approvals (excerpts)
7. Re Waste Disposal Site Application by Town of Meaford/Twp. of St. Vincent (December 13, 1990) (Joint Board) (Excerpt) 152
8. "North Simcoe Decision - New Standards for EA Hearings?", Jack Coop, Legal Emissions (Summer 1995) 157
9. Re County of Northumberland, Reasons for Ruling on Motion for Stated Case (unreported decision of Joint Board, June 22, 1995) 159

2F. Purpose of and Rationale for the Undertaking: Addressing "Need"

1. Purpose, Rationale (and Need) for an Undertaking 170
2. In the Matter of a Proposal by O.W.M.C.--"Need" (Interim Decision) (February 11, 1991) (Joint Board) 172
3. MOEE Procedure E-3-1, supra (excerpt) 181
4. Re Steetley (1995) 16 C.E.L.R. (N.S.) 188-192 182

2G. Alternatives to the Undertaking

1. Alternatives to the Undertaking 185
2. MOEE Procedure E-3-1, supra (excerpt) 187
3. Re Joint Board and Reg. Mun. of Ottawa-Carleton (excerpt) (supra) (Div. Ct.) 193
4. In the Matter of a Proposal by O.W.M.C.--Motion to Dismiss (Interim Decision) (February 11, 1991) (Joint Board) 194

2H. Alternative Methods of Carrying Out the Undertaking

1. Alternative Methods of Carrying Out the Undertaking 207
2. Re Joint Board and Reg. Mun. of Ottawa-Carleton (excerpt) (supra) (Div. Ct.) 209
3. Re Landfill Application by Reg. Mun. of Halton (excerpt) (supra) (Joint Board) 211
4. Re Landfill Application by North Simcoe Waste Management Association (excerpt) (Joint Board) (November 17, 1989) 222
5. Re Landfill Application by Town of Meaford/Twp. of St. Vincent (excerpt)(supra) (Joint Board) 226

2I. Describing and Evaluating Environmental Effects

Overview

1. Describing and Evaluating Environmental Effects 239
2. "A Framework for the Assessment of EIA Methodologies" by J. Whitney and V.MacLaren from J. Whitney and V. MacLaren (eds.), Environmental Impact Assessment: The Canadian Experience (U.Toronto, 1985, Monograph 5) (excerpts) 240

Describing Effects

1. "Toward Ecological Orientation of the Planning Process" by J.M.Kozlowski, (1989), 8 (1&2) Impact Assessment Bulletin 47 (excerpts) 245
2. "Utilizing Social Impact Assessment Variables in the Planning Model"

by R.Burdge, from (1989), 8(1&2) Impact Assessment Bulletin 85 (excerpts) 247
3. "Regional Economic and Social Impact Assessment" by G.T.MacDonald, (1990), 10(1&2) EIA Review 25 (excerpts) 255
4. "Coping with Cumulative Impacts: an Assessment of Legislative and Administrative Mechanisms" by M.J.Bardecki, (1989), 8(1 & 2) Impact Assessment bulletin 319 (excerpts) 260
5. In the Matter of Laidlaw Waste Systems Ltd.(Storrington) (March 31, 1993) (E.A.B.) (excerpts) 262

Mitigation, Net Effects

1. Mitigation and Net Effects 264
2. Mitigation and "Net Effects (JC) 265
3. "A Framework for the Assessment of EIA Methodologies" by J.Whitney and V.MacLaren from J.Whitney and V.MacLaren (eds.), Environmental Impact Assessment: The Canadian Experience (U.Toronto, 1985, Monograph 5) (excerpts) 266
4. MOEE Manual of Guidelines and Procedures (December 31, 1994), Volume 2, Part E, Guideline E-3 267
5. In the Matter of Laidlaw Waste Systems Ltd. (Storrington) (March 31, 1993) (EAB) (excerpts) 268

Evaluating Effects and Alternatives

1. Evaluating Effects and Alternatives (JC) 273
2. Re Proposed Transmission Plan for S.W. Ont. (1987), 1 C.E.L.R. (N.S.) (Joint Board) (excerpts) 274
3. Numerical Analysis - Proposed Transmission Plan 275
4. "Theory of Cost-Benefit Analysis" from McAllister, D., Evaluation in Environmental Planning (MIT Press, 1980), Chs.6 & 7 276
5. "Prophets and Profits: a Critique of Benefit/Cost Analysis for Natural Resource Decisions" by E.W. Manning, (1987), 15(1) Alternatives 36 (excerpt) 282
6. "Introduction to Evaluation Methods" from D.McAllister, Evaluation in Environmental Planning (MIT Press, 1980) (excerpts) 284
7. VHB Research & Consulting Inc., Evaluation Methods in Environmental Assessment, (MOE, 1990) (excerpts) 287
8. VHB Research & Consulting Inc., Analysis of Eight Candidate Landfill Sites in North Simcoe - EA addendum - Appendix #11, (September 22, 1992) 351
9. Cross-Examination of D. Heeney (VHB), by J. Coop in North Simcoe hearing, (June 1, 1993) 372
10. Re Landfill Application by North Simcoe Waste Management Association , 16 C.E.L.R. (N.S.) (excerpt), (Joint Board) 373

2J. Public Consultation

1. Public Consultation 375
2. Public Consultation (JC) 379
3. MOEE Guideline E-2 "Pre-Submission Consultation in the Environmental Assessment (EA) Process", (April 1994) 380
4. MOEE Procedure E-2-1 (formerly referenced by 03-03) "Procedures for Pre-Submission Consultation in the Environmental Assessment Process" 388
5. "Social Impact Assessment and the Public Involvement Process" by R. Burdge and R. Robertson, (1990), 10(1&2) EIA Review 81 (excerpts) 407
6. Re Landfill Application by North Simcoe Waste Management Association (excerpt) (supra) (Joint Board) 412
7. Re Landfill Application by Town of Meaford/Twp. of St. Vincent (excerpt) (supra) (Joint Board) 414
8. Re Steetley Quarry Products (excerpt) 16 C.E.L.R. (N.S.) (Assessment Board) 417

2K. Government Review of an Environmental Assessment

1. The Review Phase of Environmental Assessment 420
2. MOEE Guideline E-1 (formerly 03-01) "The Role of the Review and the Review Participants in the Environmental Assessment (EA) Process", (April 1994) 423
3. Re Landfill Application by Town of Meaford/Twp. of St. Vincent (excerpt) (supra) (Joint Board) 437
4. Re Steetley Quarry Products (excerpt) 16 C.E.L.R. (N.S.) (Assessment Board) 438
5. Motion by Intervenor in IWA Hearings Challenging Adequacy of Government Review - Notice of Motion of the City of Vaughan; Notice of Intention to Respond of the Province of Ontario to the Motion by the City of Vaughan and Town of Pickering; Ruling on Motions by the City of Vaughan & the Town of Pickering (January 26, 1995) (Joint Board) 439

2L. Decisions on an Environmental Assessment

1. Decisions on the Environmental Assessment 460
2. Decisions on the Environmental Assessment (JC) 462
3. MOEE Hearing Disposition Report of Grimsby, Lincoln, Pelham and West Lincoln Environmental Assessment for the Proposed Niagara Road #12 Landfill Site ("Grimsby")(May 11, 1995) 463
4. Grimsby Notice of Acceptance 466
5. Grimsby Notice of Approval to Proceed with the Undertaking 468
6. Grimsby Minutes of Settlement 473

7. A report to the Lieutenant Governor in Council on the mediation of property compensation issues related to Grimsby 489

2M. Intervenor Funding

1. Intervenor Funding 495
2. Intervenor Funding (JC) 497
3. Re Regional Municipal of Hamilton-Wentworth (headnote) (Div. Ct.) 499
4. Order in Council 3171/92 dated October 28, 1992 500
5. Environmental Assessment Board - Niagara Road 12 Site Participant Funding Program Re Participant Funding Application by the Grimsby, Pelham, Lincoln and West Lincoln Waste Management Committee dated January 4, 1993 508
6. Environmental Assessment Board's Reasons for Decision Re Steetley Quarry Products Inc. to establish, operate and close a solid waste disposal site 524
7. MAG Issues Paper #1 "The Timing of Funding Awards" 554
8. Extension of *Intervenor Funding Project Act* Announced (March 25, 1992) 563